

**Materials for**

**PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW (252S)**

**VOLUME 3**  
(Topics 12 - 15)

February 1997

Professor Craig Scott  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto

These Materials are sold at cost and  
are not to be considered as published.  
They are solely for the educational  
use of students at the University of Toronto  
or at other educational institutions  
to whom the Materials  
may also be sold at cost.

Storage

JX  
68  
S32  
1997  
v.3  
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

3 1761 03344 1866

Jx  
68  
92  
197  
v.3  
C.2

AYJ - 4635

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

FEB 28 1996

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**Materials for**  
**PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW (252S)**

**VOLUME 3**  
(Topics 12 - 15)

February 1997

Professor Craig Scott  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto

These Materials are sold at cost and  
are not to be considered as published.

They are solely for the educational  
use of students at the University of Toronto  
or at other educational institutions  
to whom the Materials  
may also be sold at cost.



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/materialsforpubl03scot>

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Volume 3

**NOTE 1:** The course will be taught using these Materials as well as Ian Brownlie, eds., Basic Documents in International Law, 4th ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995). A course reading list will indicate the provisions of instruments contained in Brownlie to be read in tandem with the readings contained in this volume and subsequent volumes.

**NOTE 2:** "K:#" refers to an extract or note from Kindred et al., International Law: Chiefly as Interpreted and Applied in Canada, 3rd ed. (1987)

"H:#" refers to an extract or note from Harris, Cases and Materials on International Law, 4th ed. (London: Sweet and Maxwell. 1991)

"HPSS:#" refers to an extract or note from Henkin, Pugh, Schachter and Smit, International Law: Cases and Materials, 2nd ed. (St. Paul, Minn.: West Publishing, 1987)

### Topic 12: TERRITORY, PERSONALITY AND RECOGNITION (I)

#### International Legal Personality

Higgins, "Participants in the International Legal System" . . . . .	1
O'Connell, <u>International Law</u> . . . . .	3

#### The Personality of States

Steinberger, "Sovereignty" . . . . .	4
Brownlie, "Independence" in <u>Principles of Public International Law</u> . . . . .	5
Brownlie, "Personality and Recognition -- Subjects of the Law" . . . . .	7
Koskenniemi, "Example: statehood and recognition" . . . . .	9

#### The Personality of the United Nations

Chart of UN Structure @ K:76 . . . . .	12
<u>Reparations Case</u> @ K:78 . . . . .	13



**The Interdependent Relationship Between the Evolution of UN Personality and the Achievement of Independence from Colonial and Neo-Colonial Racist Rule**

**The Core Doctrinal History of the Right to Self-Determination**

Higgins, "Self-Determination -- The First Phase: Self-Determination and Independence from Colonial Rule" . . . . .	17
--	----

**From South-West Africa to Namibia**

Harris, "Mandated and Trust Territories" . . . . .	19
"Namibia" in <u>Yearbook of the United Nations: Special Edition, UN Fiftieth Anniversary 1945-1995</u> . . . . .	22
General Assembly Resolution 2145 on South West Africa, 1966 . . . . .	23
<u>Namibia Case</u> . . . . .	25

**From Southern Rhodesia to Zimbabwe**

General Assembly Resolution 2151 on Southern Rhodesia, 1966 . . . . .	30
Security Council Resolution 232 on Southern Rhodesia, 1966 . . . . .	31
Gowlland-Debbas, "Collective Responses to the Unilateral Declarations of Independence of Southern Rhodesia and Palestine: An Application of the Legitimizing Function of the United Nations" . . . . .	34
"Dismantling the Colonial System -- Zimbabwe -- Towards Independence" in <u>Yearbook of the United Nations: Special Edition, UN Fiftieth Anniversary 1945-1995</u> . . . . .	38
Antonio Cassese, "Conclusion: the general principle and the customary rules on self-determination" . . . . .	39

**Topic 13:**

**TERRITORY, PERSONALITY AND RECOGNITION (II)**

**Colonial Acquisition, Acquiescence and Recognition of Sovereign Title**

"Acquisition of Territory" @ K:360 . . . . .	41
Brownlie, "The Modes of Acquisition" . . . . .	41
Scott, "Acquiescence or prescription" . . . . .	42

Scott, "The role of general recognition by the interstate community and the question of the international legality of colonialism" . . . . .	43
<u>Legal Status of Eastern Greenland @ K:365</u> . . . . .	45
<u>Temple of Preah Vihear Case, Cambodia v Thailand</u> . . . . .	49

### *Western Sahara and the Revision of International Colonial History?*

Heather Wilson, <u>International Law and the Use of Force by National Liberation Movements</u> . . . . .	56
Noble, "New Dispute Roils Western Sahara: Who'll Vote?" . . . . .	61
de Barrin, "Chasing peace through the Western Sahara"	
<u>Western Sahara Case @ HPSS: 297</u> . . . . .	63

### *The Relative Priority as Between Territorial Sovereignty and Self-Determination in the Decolonization Context*

Nash, "U.K., Spain reopen Gibraltar debate" . . . . .	69
April 1993 P.I.L. exam, Short Problem Question #10, "The Dinner Party" . . . . .	70
Higgins, Extract on Falklands/Malvinas, Gibraltar and Hong Kong in <u>Problems and Process: International Law and How We Use It</u> . . . . .	71

### *Aboriginal Peoples, Challenges to Control of Territory and the Turn to the ICCPR Human Rights Communications Procedure: Categorical Imperatives or Categorical Denials?*

#### *Community, Discrimination and Participation*

<u>Sandra Lovelace v. Canada @ K:668</u> . . . . .	72
Note on Consequences of the <u>Lovelace</u> 'View' . . . . .	72
<u>Marshall/Mikmaq Tribal Society v. Canada</u> . . . . .	72A
Higgins, "Postmodern Tribalism and the Right to Secession" . . . . .	75

### *The Lubicon Saga: International Human Rights as Normative Ceilings?*

Rudy Platiel, "Alberta Crees Still Waiting for Settlement of Native Claim -- The Lubicons Refuse to Give In Despite Their Failure to Gain reserve Land and a Treaty for More Than a Decade" . . . . .	76
---	----

<u>Omniyak/Lubicon Lake Band v. Canada</u> . . . . .	79
Canadian Government "Standard Response Letter" . . . . .	83
Letter of Dec. 18, 1991 from Chief Bernard Omniyak to the UN Human Rights Committee . . . . .	84
"Austrian Parliament Passes Lubicon Resolution" . . . . .	87
<u>Lansman v. Finland, Comm. 511/1992</u> . . . . .	90
Human Rights Committee General Comment No. 23(50) on Art. 27 . . . . .	92

**Topic 14:**  
**TERRITORY, PERSONALITY AND RECOGNITION (III)**

**Revisiting Recognition I: International Aboriginal Activism and the Struggle for Recognition**

Brownlie, "The Rights of Peoples in Modern International Law", . . . . .	94
Sanders, "Aboriginal Rights: The Search for Recognition in International Law" . . . . .	95
Williams, "Encounters On the Frontiers of International Human Rights Law: Redefining the Terms of Indigenous Peoples' Survival in the World" . . . . .	98
Anaya, "Indigenous Rights Norms in Contemporary International Law" . . . . .	102
Working Group on Indigenous Populations, <u>Draft Universal Declaration on Rights of Indigenous Peoples</u> (1993) . . . . .	104
Statement by the Government of Canada on Art. 3 of the 1993 Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, November 1996 . . . . .	107
Orkin, "Using the Inuit as human flagpoles" . . . . .	109
Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (RCAP), "The Inuit Circumpolar Conference: The Emergence of Internationalism" . . . . .	111

**Revisiting Recognition II: The Evolving Status of Palestine**

Heather Wilson, <u>International Law and the Use of Force by National Liberation Movements</u> . . . . .	114A
--	------



Palestinian National Council, <u>Declaration of Independence</u> . . . . .	114C
Gowlland-Debbas, "Collective Responses to the Unilateral Declarations of Independence of Southern Rhodesia and Palestine: An Application of the Legitimizing Function of the United Nations" . . . . .	114F
<u>The Economist</u> Editorial, "Palestine by Proclamation" . . . . .	114J

**Topic 15:**  
**TERRITORY, PERSONALITY AND RECOGNITION (IV)**

**The Road to War in Bosnia: State Dissolution, Self-Determination Doctrine and the Force of Recognition**

**Background Norms**

Valerie Bunce, "The Elusive Peace in the Former Yugoslavia" . . . . .	115
---	-----

**The Formalised Process of Recognition and Non-Recognition**

**General**

Kingsbury, "Claims by Non-State Groups in International Law" . . . . .	120
European Community, <u>Declaration on the Guidelines on the Recognition of New States in Eastern Europe and in the Soviet Union &amp; Declaration on Yugoslavia</u> . . . . .	132
Ragazzi, "Introductory Note" . . . . .	133
Pellet, "The Opinions of the Badinter Arbitration Committee: A Second Breath for the Self-Determination of Peoples" . . . . .	133

**The Dissolution of the SFRY and the Question of Its Successor(s)**

Badinter Commission Opinion No. 1 (SFRY: dissolution or secession?) . . . . .	134
Badinter Commission Opinion No. 8 (Is process of dissolution in SFRY complete?) . . . . .	135
Badinter Commission Opinion No. 9 (How to regulate questions of succession as between states emerging from SFRY?) . . . . .	136
Badinter Commission Opinion No. 10 (Entitlement of FRY to be recognised as new state?) . . . . .	137
"UN votes to expel Yugoslavia: Assembly move unprecedented" . . . . .	139

**The Recognition Process and the Conditions of Respect for Human Rights and Self-Determination**

Badinter Commission Opinion No. 2 (Entitlement of Serbian population in Bosnia to right to self-determination) . . . . .	140
Badinter Opinion 4 (Recognition of Bosnia-Herzegovina?) . . . . .	140
Badinter Opinion No. 5 (Recognition of Croatia?) . . . . .	142
Badinter Opinion No. 6 (Recognition of Macedonia?) . . . . .	143

**Bosnia and the Prevention of War: Reconceiving Boundaries and Personality?**

<u>Frontier Dispute (Burkina Faso/Mali)</u> . . . . .	146
Badinter Commission Opinion No. 3 (the legal relevance of former internal boundaries) . . . . .	150
Ratner, "Drawing a Better Line: <u>Uti Possidetis</u> and the Borders of New States" . . . . .	151
Editorial/Globe and Mail, "Swallow Hard and sign here" . . . . .	166
Editorial/The Economist, "Imperfect peace plan better than nothing" . . . . .	167
Text of Bosnian Serbs' Peace Resolution, (Jan. 21, 1993) . . . . .	168
Szasz, "Introductory Note" (on Dayton Framework Agreement for Peace in Bosnia, November 1995) . . . . .	169
US Dept. of State, <u>Summary of Dayton Peace Agreement on Bosnia-Herzegovina</u> . . . . .	170
Map Showing Shape of new Territorial Allocations in Bosnia Under Dayton Agreement . . . . .	174
Strauss, "Bosnian Serbs plan secession" . . . . .	175